Best Practices of Formatting Review: A Discussion

Valeria Caviness
University of North Carolina Greensboro
Student Deadlines for Submission of Dissertation

Fall 2019

- Approval Copy - November 8
  - Approval copy submitted to Graduate School for format review
  - Original signed title page and approval page due to the Graduate School

- Final Copy - December 5
  - Final copy due by 5:00 pm – this copy should be complete and meet the formatting requirements
  - ETD Release Form, ETD Embargo Form (if needed) and Survey of Earned Doctorates (Ph.D.) also due
Student Deadlines for Submission of Thesis

Fall 2019

- Approval Copy- November 18
  - Approval Copy submitted to Graduate School for format Review
- Final Copy- December 5
  - Final copy due by 5:00 pm – this copy should be complete and meet the formatting requirements
  - Original signed title page and approval page
  - ETD Release Form and ETD Embargo Form (if needed)
Student Deadlines for Submission of Thesis/Dissertation

Submission dates vary by institutions
- One week before the semester ends
- Two weeks before Commencement
- Three weeks before Commencement
- Three to Six weeks (based on semester) before Commencement
- Three weeks before the end of classes
- Four and a half weeks before the end of the semester
- Seven weeks before the end of the semester
- Eight weeks before the end of the semester
- May 1st, August 1st, and December 1st with conferral at the end of the month

Other Universities
Student Deadlines for Submission of Thesis/Dissertation

- Submission dates vary by institutions
  - Deadlines for approval are Spring – April, Summer – July, Fall – November
  - Dead Day – Friday before the last day of the semester
  - The Friday of the last full week of classes
  - Formatting Checks – May Graduation: 11 weeks before Graduation; August Graduation: 8 weeks before Graduation; January Graduation: 9 weeks before Graduation
  - Formal Submissions: May 6 weeks before Graduation; August Graduation 4 weeks before; January 6 weeks before

Other Universities
Last Dates for Dissertation Defense
October, November and December 2019
18 Oct. Mississippi State
25 Oct. University at Buffalo, SUNY
6 Nov. West Virginia
8 Nov. Tennessee Tech
25 Nov. Notre Dame
27 Nov. Iowa State University
29 Nov. Arkansas
3 Dec. Notre Dame
5 Dec. Kentucky
25 Nov. Iowa State University
27 Nov. Notre Dame
29 Nov. Arkansas
3 Dec. Kentucky
5 Dec. Saint Louis
18 Oct. Mississippi State
Dates of 1st Submission

October, November and December 2019
Dates of Final Submission

November and December 2019
Student Deadlines for Submission of Thesis and Dissertation

University Links

- George Mason University Procedure:
  - [https://library.gmu.edu/udts/process#step2](https://library.gmu.edu/udts/process#step2)

- The University of North Carolina at Greensboro Procedure
  - [https://grs.uncg.edu/current/etd/#1560972662582-1a80f504-4420](https://grs.uncg.edu/current/etd/#1560972662582-1a80f504-4420)

- University at Buffalo
Student Deadlines for Submission of Thesis and Dissertation

University Links

- University of Dayton
  - https://libguides.udayton.edu/c.php?g=15209&p=82887

- Miami University
  - http://miamioh.edu/graduate-school/current-students/steps-to-graduation/index.html

- The George Washington University
  - https://library.gwu.edu/etd/submission-deadlines

- Iowa State University
  - https://www.grad-college.iastate.edu/calendar/
Penalties for Missed Deadlines

- Students are removed from the list of candidates for graduation
- Students must reapply for graduation
- Registration is required in their final semester
Penalties for Missed Deadlines

Other Universities

- Students are removed from the list of candidates for graduation and will graduate in the next semester
  - Some Universities offer an option to avoid registration in the next semester
    - Finish the document by the last day of the semester to avoid registration in the text term
    - Special Registration – finish by the 1st day of classes in the next semester to avoid full registration
Communication of Formatting Requirements

- Guide for the Preparation of Theses and Dissertations
- ETD Workshop
- Online Resources include a Canvas Course and Formatting in Microsoft Word (step by step instructions on how to do the most common requirements)
- 1 on 1 Formatting Sessions available to graduating students
Communication of Formatting Requirements

Other Universities

Guide for the Preparation of Theses and Dissertations
Info Sessions
Online Resources include Sample pages, templates, and documents with tips
Bootcamp
Resources Provided by Universities

- George Mason University
  - [https://library.gmu.edu/udts/resources](https://library.gmu.edu/udts/resources)
- The University of North Carolina at Greensboro
  - [https://grs.uncg.edu/current/etd/#1560972662597-fc4be23b-f1b6](https://grs.uncg.edu/current/etd/#1560972662597-fc4be23b-f1b6)
- University of Florida
  - [http://guides.uflib.ufl.edu/ufir/honors_theses](http://guides.uflib.ufl.edu/ufir/honors_theses)
Resources Provided by Universities

- University at Buffalo
  - [https://grad.buffalo.edu/succeed/graduate/electronic-submission/guidelines.html](https://grad.buffalo.edu/succeed/graduate/electronic-submission/guidelines.html)

- Ohio University
  - [https://www.ohio.edu/graduate/etd](https://www.ohio.edu/graduate/etd)

- University of Arkansas
Resources Provided by Universities

- The University of Iowa

- North Dakota State University
  - [https://www.ndsu.edu/gradschool/current_students/graduation/theses_dissertations_papers](https://www.ndsu.edu/gradschool/current_students/graduation/theses_dissertations_papers)

- Cornell University
Resources Provided by Universities

- **Georgia Tech**
  - [https://grad.gatech.edu/theses-dissertations](https://grad.gatech.edu/theses-dissertations)

- **University of Kentucky**

- **Tennessee Tech**
  - [https://www.tntech.edu/graduatestudies/etd.php](https://www.tntech.edu/graduatestudies/etd.php)
Resources Provided by Universities

- Saint Louis University
  - [https://www.slu.edu/academics/graduate/pdfs/formatting_guide_revision_october_2017_final.pdf](https://www.slu.edu/academics/graduate/pdfs/formatting_guide_revision_october_2017_final.pdf)

- Colorado State University

- University of Notre Dame
  - [https://graduateschool.nd.edu/policies-forms/doctoral-dissertations-masters-theses/author-resources/](https://graduateschool.nd.edu/policies-forms/doctoral-dissertations-masters-theses/author-resources/)
Resources Provided by Universities

- Texas A & M University

- University of Illinois
  - https://grad.illinois.edu/thesis

- University of Dayton
  - https://libguides.udayton.edu/c.php?g=15209&p=82886

- Miami University
  - https://libanswers.lib.miamioh.edu/faq/205480
Resources Provided by Universities

- The George Washington University
  - https://library.gwu.edu/etd

- The Ohio State University
  - https://gradsch.osu.edu/completing-your-degree/dissertations-theses/document-preparation

- West Virginia University
  - https://etd.lib.wvu.edu/

- Iowa State University
  - https://www.grad-college.iastate.edu/thesis/
Formatting Issues

- Lack of Review and Attention to Detail
- Spacing – Triple spaces
- Table of Contents
- Subheadings
Lack of Review
Table of Contents
Margins
Tables/Figures
Placement and Spacing of Tables and Figures
Subheadings
Submitting a document that does not follow the guidelines at all
### Other Issues Noted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pagination</td>
<td>Roman numerals to Arabic numbers, Landscape pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not following template</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary Pages</td>
<td>“Inability/unwillingness to replicate exactly the standard set up of preliminary pages”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latex</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to obtain permission</td>
<td>The need to obtain permission to use copyrighted material</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other Issues Noted

- Submitting a scanned printout rather than original electronic document
- Page Order
- Justified Text
- Capitalization Consistency
- PDF Accessibility
- Table Titles
Number of Reviews - UNCG

Dissertations - average 4 times

Thesis – average 5 times
Number of Reviews
Other Universities

- 3 to 5 Times - 52%
- 0-2 Times - 48%
How Formatting Issues are Communicated

- Checklist in a word document
  - There is a check box beside each item for students to check off as they correct the issue
- Checklist is sent to student via email in ProQuest Administrator
How Formatting Issues are Communicated

Other Universities

- Return to student via Email
  - Comments in the PDF
  - Word Document
- In person feedback
- Canvas
Additional Documents

- Original signed title page and approval page
- Original ETD Release Form
- Original ETD Embargo Form
- Survey of Earned Doctorates (Ph.D. only) – Requested not Required
Additional Documents - Other Universities

- Signed Pages to indicate approval of Thesis/Dissertation
- ETD Release Forms /Embargo Forms
- Oral Defense Forms
Survey of Earned Doctorates (Some Universities require the survey)

Copyright Permissions

Certifying letters from co-authors
Additional Documents - Other Universities

- Plagiarism check by Turn It In
- Research Integrity Agreement
- Certifying letters from co-authors
Additional Documents- Other Universities

Exit Surveys

ETD Submission Forms
Difficulty in Receiving Paperwork - UNCG

Dissertation paperwork is due at the same time as the approval copy submission (title page and approval page)

ETD Release Forms and Survey of Earned Doctorates due at time of final submission

Thesis paperwork due at the time of final submission (title page, approval page and ETD Release Forms)
Penalties for Late Paperwork - UNCG

If paperwork is not received, student does not graduate. This is very rare

No penalties for missing the deadline – paperwork is accepted up the last possible moment
How UNCG is addressing the issue

- ETD Release Form

Paperwork due at the end of the semester causes most difficulty

Putting new procedures in place to track paperwork in a timely manner

• Increasing communication with students about importance of paperwork and deadlines
Difficulty in Receiving Paperwork Other Universities

- 44% of Respondents had difficulty receiving paperwork
  - Students who do not turn in paperwork face delayed graduation
  - Work with students if dissertation has been submitted
Do you think students struggle with formatting more today than in the past?

No was the response from the Survey 75% vs, 25%
UNCG Attempts to Improve the Process

- **1 on 1 Formatting Appointments**
  - Let students make an appointment for 30 minute time slot (in person or webex meeting)
  - Still too early to determine effectiveness but interest has increased over general walk in time. More students are seen when appointments are made.
UNCG Attempts to Improve the Process

Communication with the student
- Reached out to students with the most formatting issues by separate email to
  1. indicate concern about the amount of work required,
  2. stressed the final deadline
  3. offered the student an opportunity to move graduation to the next semester
UNCG Attempts to Improve the Process

- Submission Agreement
  - Added Submission Agreement to ProQuest Account Opening Process
    - Too early to tell about effectiveness but does provide leverage to students who submit without following the guidelines

- Dissertation/Thesis Paperwork
  - Changing the tracking process of paperwork
  - Communicating with the student immediately following the deadlines to alert them paperwork is missing
Other Universities
Steps to Improve the Process

Discussion Today
Results of Discussion

- Some Universities found the use of a Template reduced the number of submission
- One on One meetings effectiveness was divided
  - Some Universities found this very helpful
  - Others stopped preliminary reviews
  - One issue that developed out of one on one meetings were students thinking their document had been approved
- Frustrations
  - Students pick and choose what they want to fix and then resubmit without all issues being addressed
When to Approve the Document to move the Process Forward?

- **After 3-4 rounds**
- **When the formatting requirements have been met with a minor error remaining**
- **If overall consistency has been met, approve the document**
- **Glaring errors are not accepted**

   - Bookmark Errors
   - Incorrect Margins
   - Inconsistencies
   - Glaring Spacing Issues
   - Table of Contents Errors
What policies are in place to deal dissertations that include chapters with multiple authors?

Must the student be the 1st author?
Self-plagiarism (also known as text-recycling or reuse), as defined by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services' Office of Research Integrity, “occurs when authors reuse their own previously written work or data in a ‘new’ written product without letting the reader know that this material has appeared elsewhere.

https://my.nps.edu/documents/105790666/106471207/Self_Plagiarism/5c2b722d-5965-4dfa-99dd-36a9781fda70
How Universities Handle Multi-authored Dissertations

**UNCG**
- The chair fills out a form that details each chapter that is multi-authored.
  - It includes publication information
  - The contribution of each author
  - If the student is not the primary author, requires Dean approval

**Other Universities**
- Authorization from the publisher
- Must include a summary chapter to tie the works together
- Author must include a description of their level of contribution to the article
- Copyright Permissions
- Format varies – Either must follow the journal format or the University Format
Results of Research of Other Universities

- Rutgers University
  - Proper Citation of prior work
  - Clarify in the thesis or dissertation the student’s contribution
  - Copyright ownership of previously published work
  - Rights of co-author's

- The George Washington University
  - Check – who owns copyright and can you republish?
  - Ask – is it ok with co-author's to republish work
  - Cite the prior work
Results of Research of Other Universities

- Naval Postgraduate School
  - Proper Citation of prior work
  - Permission of co-author’s
  - Define stapling – “Combining several previously published papers to form a large portion of thesis or dissertation.”
  - https://my.nps.edu/documents/105790666/106471207/Self_Plagiarism/5c2b722d-5965-4dfa-99dd-36a9781ffd70

- The Pennsylvania State University
  - A letter of permission from the Copyright Owner
  - First Author on paper
  - Indicate contributions to article in a preface to thesis/dissertation
Results of Research of Other Universities

University of California – Berkeley
Must include introduction, transitional section and conclusion as well as published articles
Permission of co-author’s
Co-author must be credited

Purdue University
A letter of permission from the Copyright Owner
Results of Research of Other Universities

Arizona State University
Must be first author or if second author or later, must include additional information (1-2 pages) at the front of the work about the project and their contributions
Must have signed letters of permission from the co-authors

UNC
Written permission from the Copyright Owner
Results of Research of Other Universities

**UNC Charlotte**
- Must be first author
- Only one article before the proposal defense may be included
- Must have permission from copyright owner and additional authors

**University of Delaware**
- Written permission from the Copyright Owner
- First Author